TEACHER SUPPLY AND DEMAND IN MANITOBA

REPORT

of the

INTERORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE

Submitted to

THE MINISTER OF MANITOBA EDUCATION, TRAINING AND YOUTH

MARCH 2002

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Letter of Submission i

Members of the Interorganizational Committee on Teacher Supply and Demand ii

A. Background 1

B. Provincial Trends 2

C. Regional Trends 3

D. National and International Trends and Initiatives 4

E. Influencing Factors 5

F. Committee Position 6

Appendices—Data Tables 8

References 12

104-05752/

LETTER OF SUBMISSION

Collège universitaire de Saint-Boniface

Faculté d'éducation
Bureau du doyen

200, avenue de la Cathédrale
Saint-Boniface (Manitoba) R2H 0H7
Téléphone : (204) 233-0210
Télécopieur : (204) 233-0217
www.ustboniface.mb.ca

March 18, 2002

Honourable Drew Caldwell
Minister
Education, Training and Youth
168 Legislative Building
Winnipeg MB R3C 0V8

Dear Minister Caldwell:

Attached please find a copy of the Report of the Interorganizational Committee on Teacher Supply and Demand. The Committee was struck, you will recall, at your request to consider the issue of teacher supply and demand in Manitoba. The Committee was composed of representatives from The Manitoba Association of School Trustees, Manitoba Teachers' Society, Manitoba Association of School Superintendents, Manitoba Federation of Independent Schools, Faculties of Education, and Manitoba Education, Training and Youth. I agreed to serve as Chair of the Committee.

The Report will provide you with some background information; provincial, regional, and national trends; factors influencing supply and demand; and the Committee's position. I should emphasize that agreement on potential solutions was not reached among all parties; however, the ideas listed represent general points of discussion.

I trust the document will be helpful to you, and indeed to all educational partners, in deliberations on the issue of teacher supply and demand.

Yours sincerely,

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY

Raymond Théberge, Ph.D.
Chair

Attachment

MEMBERS OF THE
INTERORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE ON
TEACHER SUPPLY AND DEMAND

Raymond Théberge	Collège universitaire de Saint-Boniface (chair)
Judy Bradley	Manitoba Teachers' Society
Jean Britton	Manitoba Education, Training and Youth
Carolyn Duhamel	Manitoba Association of School Trustees
David Jenkinson	University of Manitoba
Jim MacKay	Red River College
Thom MacNeill	Brandon University
Dan Reagan	Superintendent, Flin Flon School Division No. 46
Arnold Reimer	Manitoba Association of School Superintendents
Joël Simpson	Catholic Schools Commission
Al Tataryn	Manitoba Education, Training and Youth
Graig Wallis	Manitoba Association of School Trustees
David Yeo	Manitoba Education, Training and Youth

TEACHER SUPPLY AND DEMAND IN MANITOBA

A. BACKGROUND

Teacher supply and demand has received a great deal of national and provincial attention over the past several decades. Many studies have been conducted and forecasts made by government departments, commissions/task forces, education associations, and interested researchers. Although there are many factors that influence supply and demand, in the broadest sense the following features are common to most studies:[1]

Supply
a) stock of teachers (existing teaching staff)
b) potential new entries to profession (new graduates, qualified applicants from outside province/country, and reentrants)
c) departures from profession (retirements, emigration, career changes, disability/deaths, leaves, resignations, and terminations)

Demand
a) school-aged population and student participation rates
b) pupil-teacher ratios
c) course/position specialties (e.g., principals, math teachers, etc)
d) use of technology

In 1989 the Canadian Teachers' Federation[2] (CTF) projected that Manitoba would experience an increased demand for secondary teachers throughout the '90s and an increased demand for elementary teachers until 1996–97 followed by a decline. One year later, in 1990, a Manitoba inter-organizational Task Force[3] came to a different conclusion, stating that the demand for teachers would remain fairly constant across the province throughout the '90s with greatest demand (acquisition and retention) being experienced in northern Manitoba. The Task Force also projected that the greatest demand would be in subject/program areas such as French Immersion, music and special needs. CTF's predictions did not materialize, while those of the Task Force held true.

Recently, many provinces (e.g., Nova Scotia[4], British Columbia[5], Saskatchewan[6], Ontario[7] and Manitoba[8]) have been examining the issue of teacher supply and demand. In Manitoba, the Department conducted a survey of public school superintendents and band school principals during the summer of 2000. The findings from these studies paralleled those of the 1990 Department study (referred to above), with the exception of the subject areas most in need being slightly altered to senior high mathematics, natural sciences (e.g., physics, biology), vocational/industrial education, computer science, and French Immersion.

During summer 2000, the Canadian Teachers' Federation contracted a new survey[9] of school boards across Canada and found that over half were experiencing recruitment problems. Shortages were reported primarily in the subject areas of general science, chemistry, biology and physics. Three-quarters of the school boards also reported difficulty attracting substitute teachers.

In December 2000, in response to concerns raised by the Manitoba Association of School Trustees, the Minister of Education, Training and Youth directed that a meeting of stakeholders be held to review and discuss the issue of teacher supply and demand. At that meeting, there was concurrence that a working group should be formed to further investigate the issues and to develop a report for the Minister's consideration. Using information that was readily available (both qualitative and quantitative), the following report represents the work of this group.

In February 2001, a review of the literature related to teacher supply and demand was released by E.S. Hickcox, Adjunct Professor, University of Manitoba. His review [10] concluded that the problem is not so much a teacher shortage as it is distribution (i.e., matching the teacher to the job).

In May 2001, the Council of Ministers of Education Canada (CMEC), in cooperation with Statistics Canada's Centre for Education Statistics (CES), sponsored a pan-Canadian symposium [11] on Teacher Education and Training, with supply and demand being one of four major issues discussed. As a follow-up to the symposium, CMEC created an interprovincial working group to articulate strategies to address recruitment and retention issues across Canada. All provinces/territories have reported that they are currently experiencing or anticipating teacher shortages, with the exception of Quebec that has historically reported teacher surpluses.

Over the past couple of years, the Government of Manitoba introduced legislation that directly affect the supply and demand issue. In June 2000, teacher collective bargaining parameters were amended in The Public Schools Act, and in July 2001, The Teachers' Pensions Act was amended to limit a teacher on full-time contract and in receipt of pension from receiving both a pension and a salary after one-hundred and twenty days of continuous employment.

Funding to schools has increased annually under the current Government. Over the past 2.5 years, $63.5 million new operating dollars have been committed to public schools, as compared to just $15.2 million between 1995 and 1999. For the first time in Manitoba history, the 2002–03 total direct provincial funding for public schools topped $1.0 billion.

In January 2002, Manitoba Teachers' Society submitted a report to Manitoba Education, Training and Youth titled "The Teaching Force in Manitoba: Recruitment and Retention". The paper examines demographic and policy factors that have an impact on the supply and demand of teachers in Manitoba, looks at problems associated with recruitment and retention, and offers a list of six recommendations for action.

As a follow-up to the Manitoba Teacher Recruitment and Retention Survey [8], the Native Education Directorate is currently developing a concept paper to address the recruitment and retention of teachers in northern Manitoba. Specific attention is being made to introducing a Northern Teachers Assistants Program, and a Young Teachers Recruitment Program. Details are not yet available.

B. PROVINCIAL TRENDS

A review of existing Manitoba data revealed the following trends (Refer to Appendices for complete data tables):

- School-age population is increasing—After experiencing a steady decline during the 1980s, Manitoba's population aged 5–18 years started to increase annually in the early 1990s. Between 1995 and 2001 it increased from 226,463 to 232,183 (2.5%).

- K–S4 enrolments decreasing—Over the past decade, Manitoba's K–S4 enrolments (excluding First Nation schools) have been decreasing, going from 208,913 in 1992/93 to 206,438 in 2001/02 (1.2% decline). Public school enrolments are decreasing while enrolments within both home schooling and independent schools are increasing.

- Number of teachers is recovering—Throughout most of the 1990s, Manitoba's public school teaching force was decreasing. Starting in 1999/2000, however, the trend started to reverse with slow gains recorded over the past 3 years. Between 1995/96 and 2001/02, there are 353 fewer educators in the public school system.

- Student-educator ratios are stable—Across the public school system, the ratio of FTE students to each FTE educator has remained fairly constant over the past seven years, varying between 15.3 to 15.4 each year, with a decrease to 15.0 recorded in 2001/02. Over the same time period, the ratio of FTE students to FTE regular instructing teachers has varied between 18.7 to 19.0 annually, with 18.5 students/instructing teacher recorded for 2001/02.

- Manitoba's teaching force is aging—The proportion of public school teachers who are eligible to retire (i.e., age 55+) grows annually, increasing from 5.0% in 1989/90 to 8.2% in 2001/02. Annually, approximately ¼ of teachers eligible to retire actually do retire. In the year 2001/02, there are 3 times as many teachers eligible to retire than there are new teachers aged 20–24 years.

- Manitoba graduates more new teachers than it hires—Annually, less that one-half of the graduates from Manitoba's Faculties of Education obtain employment as a regular teacher within Manitoba's public school system, with another 10–20% obtaining employment as substitutes. Since 1994, the number of annual graduates has decreased from a high of 963 in 1994 to 753 in 2001.

  In 1995, only 29.2% of graduates were employed on a regular basis as a teacher in a Manitoba public school, climbing to 46.6% in 2001. In 2001, 17.5% of new teacher graduates worked as substitutes.

- Number of annual teacher retirements is increasing—Over the past decade, there has been a steady growth in the number of teachers who retire each year. Between 1990 and 2000, the annual number grew from 316 to 540.

C. REGIONAL TRENDS

In order to examine the impact of supply and demand at a school division level, Manitoba Education, Training and Youth conducted opinion-based surveys of superintendents and First Nation school principals during summer 2000[8]. The following information was received:

- Northern and rural divisions/districts have greater difficulties in recruiting and retaining teachers than do urban divisions. These difficulties have been historical, but in many areas of the province are becoming more accentuated in recent years, and are projected to become critical in the near future.

- Although the demand for new teachers varies across divisions/districts, the greatest need is within the following specific classifications:
  - subjects: senior high mathematics, natural sciences (e.g., physics, biology), vocational/industrial, computer science, and French Immersion,
  - positions: resource teachers, specialists (e.g., clinicians), and administrators (e.g., principals),

- teacher skills: technology,
- diversity: Aboriginal teachers.

- There are insufficient practica opportunities that connect faculty students and staff to the rural experience.

- The declining number of substitute teachers in rural areas is of concern to superintendents who find it difficult to provide coverage to accommodate health leaves and PD activities for teaching staff.

- Metro-Winnipeg has the highest number of teachers, and the highest proportion of their teaching force, that will be eligible to retire over the next decade.

- Recruitment and retention are major concerns.

D. NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL TRENDS AND INITIATIVES

Across the globe, teacher supply and demand is an issue. Within Canada, all provinces, with the exception of Quebec, are predicting future shortages. Similar to Manitoba, the current concern relates to the qualifications and availability of teachers being able to teach in rural/remote regions, selected subject areas (math, science, language, vocational/technical, and special education), and to serve in administrative positions. An overall shortage of teachers (i.e., supply not meeting the demand at a provincial and/or national level), however, is a worry for the future. Clouding the issue is the unknown impact of alternative teaching strategies through the use of information technology … a factor that may decrease the demand for more teachers, or conversely simply change the parameters of the demand.

At the international level, countries such as United States, England, Australia and New Zealand are experiencing teacher shortages and seeking solutions. Sample media headlines over the past couple of months include: "Governor announces new initiative to promote recruitment and retention", "UK teacher shortage hits New Zealand", "Another school shut by shortages", "Schools face four-day week", and "What deters would-be teachers?"

Canadian provincial ministries and international governments are seeking short- and long-term solutions. Examples of initiatives that appear in the literature and media reports include:

Recruitment
- shepherding other professionals into teaching (fast-track certificate programs)
- offering signing bonuses
- paying a new teacher's university education on condition they return to community for a period of time
- altering salary grids to acknowledge relevant non-teaching experience
- providing retraining of existing teachers in high needs areas
- instituting after-degree programs to facilitate local hiring
- training paraprofessionals to meet needs
- recruiting candidates from alternative preparation programs
- establishing school-university partnerships
- providing mentoring supports to new teachers
- increasing compensation for beginning teachers

- hiring new teachers under temporary, emergency, or provisional licenses
- increasing the entry salary level for teachers in targeted high-demand areas
- recruiting from and training in the community
- encouraging teachers who left the profession to return
- finding new and innovative ways to profile the profession.

Retention

- implementing scheduling changes that allow common planning time for same-grade or same-subject teachers
- implementing team or interdisciplinary teaching
- assigning a mentor teacher to work with each new teacher
- giving first year teachers less than a full teaching load
- increasing compensation for all teachers
- improving staff development opportunities for teachers
- providing financial rewards to successful teachers
- providing financial rewards to all teachers for a school's success
- offering one-time financial rewards
- providing non-financial rewards to successful teachers
- involving teachers in decision making
- providing financial bonuses for continuing contracts.

E. INFLUENCING FACTORS

a) The Choice between Early and Late Retirement

As the teaching force ages, a large number of teachers are now or will soon be in the position to retire. However, age projections by themselves can not predict future teaching vacancies. Some teachers choose to utilize early retirement opportunities (which has the effect of spreading the turnover of teachers across a longer period of time), while others choose to work beyond the traditional retirement age (facilitated by there being no mandatory retirement legislation in Manitoba). Additionally, some teachers leave teaching for other occupations prior to retirement, reducing the number of teachers reaching retirement age. The choice between early and late retirement is influenced by factors such as feelings about teaching as a job, adequacy of pensions, the economic climate, personal and health concerns[12].

b) Provision of Supports to Promote Teaching in High Needs Areas

Although there is no absolute shortage of teachers in Manitoba, there still is a shortage in particular subjects areas, position types, and geographic locations. Nationally, there is a Labour Mobility Agreement to facilitate teacher movement across Canada, but across provinces and within each province there is a lack of information available to teachers on context of teaching positions being posted. Indeed, many teachers are unaware of the high demand areas, and the associated opportunity they may have to promote their skills when in demand. Potentially, there is a need to equalize resources and create a recruitment and induction system with incentives and supports for teaching in high need areas[13].

c) Enhancing Professional Development

Research has also shown that school reform efforts that focus on improving the quality of teacher education programs and professional development opportunities have helped to make teachers feel more comfortable in their positions, engaged in the teaching process,

and encouraged to continue in the profession[14]. Additionally, as shown in a Connecticut school reform process[15], the introduction of higher standards for teacher preparation contributed to eliminating teaching shortage instead of making it worse. A part of the reform efforts provided incentives for teachers, including a mortgage assistance program to help certified teachers who taught in a priority district to purchase a home, loan forgiveness programs from debt accumulated during training, early recruitment of high school students into the teacher education program, and alternative certification programs.

F. COMMITTEE POSITION

The Committee reached consensus on the following:

a) at a province-wide level, Manitoba actually has a surplus of available teachers each year, but there remains a shortage in rural and northern regions within specific subject areas and position types,
b) teacher supply and demand is a global problem that does not have a one-size-fits-all solution,
c) both short and long-term actions are required,
d) it is a joint responsibility of all education partners to seek solutions, noting that there is a need to go beyond a purely "quantitative" approach (i.e., ensuring an appropriate number of teachers to meet the demand) to incorporating a "qualitative" perspective (i.e., ensuring a qualified and committed teaching force to meet the demand).

While the Committee was able to achieve considerable consensus as to the nature and scope of the issues directly related to teacher supply and demand in Manitoba, there was not the same level of agreement with respect to potential solutions. Ideas and approaches varied reflecting the diverse perspectives amongst participating organizations. However, in order to facilitate a balanced perspective in searching for future action, the Committee identified the following opportunities and challenges that should be considered:

Opportunities

- there is a annual pool of Faculty of Education graduates who are not hired into teaching positions,
- there is a pool of retired teachers who have a wealth of experience and knowledge,
- some superintendents are looking for ways to bring local community members into the teaching profession,
- the Faculties of Education want to ensure that their respective teacher education programs are "state of the art",
- there is a collegial attitude among stakeholder organizations and government to work together for the greater benefit of all.

Challenges

- there are limited financial resources to add to the system,
- supply and demand issues vary according to geographic region of the province,
- demand is not general, but rather specific to subject areas and position types,
- Manitoba's teaching force is aging with the number of retirements increasing annually.

The short and long-term actions suggested below identify only a beginning approach to address the issues of teacher supply and demand.

In the short-term

- The Department continue to work with other provinces to enhance the image of teaching as a valued profession.
- Faculties of Education continue to promote teaching as a rewarding profession by providing enhanced career guidance materials for use in secondary schools.
- School divisions/districts continue to encourage retired teachers to return to the education system in a mentoring capacity and as substitutes.

To address the urgent need for certified teachers in northern/rural schools

- Teacher certification requirements should be amended to recognize prior learning experience, especially in Aboriginal and remote communities. This would shorten the amount of time it would take for a qualified community member to obtain their teaching degree.

In the long-term

- The Department work with education partners to evolve the concerns and ideas expressed in this report into a Provincial Strategic Plan related to teacher recruitment and retention. Such a plan would require:
  - the Department to conduct an annual province-wide scan to identify high need locations, subjects, and position specialities,
  - the Faculties of Education to review entrance criteria for their teacher education programs with an aim to set enrolment targets specific to areas of need,
  - the Department, Faculties of Education, and school divisions to collaborate in being responsive to the needs of the field.
- Components of the Plan could include:
  - adjusting the resignation/retirement dates to provide more opportunity for recruitment and hiring,
  - providing financial support for rural practica,
  - developing a centralized web site that contains comprehensive information on new postings,
  - targeting professional development opportunities for existing teachers,
  - formally recognizing teacher excellence.

* * * *

APPENDICES—DATA TABLES

MANITOBA POPULATION BY AGE
1995 to 2001

	0–4	5–14	15–18	19–24	25–54	55–64	65+	Total
1995	83,129	163,801	62,662	96,186	479,900	91,160	152,933	1,129,771
1996	81,858	164,833	63,416	95,154	483,709	91,898	153,478	1,134,346
1997	80,355	165,378	63,713	94,260	486,449	92,355	154,253	1,136,763
1998	79,158	165,508	63,958	93,638	487,803	93,997	154,810	1,138,872
1999	75,664	166,374	64,262	94,098	490,880	96,503	155,610	1,143,391
2000	73,573	166,532	65,067	93,828	492,957	98,594	155,415	1,145,966
2001	71,999	166,294	65,889	93,957	494,777	101,694	155,469	1,150,034

Source: Statistics Canada

MANITOBA STUDENT ENROLLMENT
(Excluding Adult Learning Centres)
1990/1991 to 2001/2002

	Public	Independent	Home-school	TOTAL
1990/1991	197,586	10,555	455	208,596
1991/1992	196,894	11,021	479	208,394
1992/1993	196,619	11,640	654	208,913
1993/1994	196,195	11,986	666	208,847
1994/1995	194,687	12,836	634	208,157
1995/1996	195,218	13,116	650	208,984
1996/1997	195,149	13,516	770	209,435
1997/1998	193,190	14,063	857	208,110
1998/1999	192,318	14,019	1,066	207,403
1999/2000	192,196	14,230	918	207,344
2000/2001	192,299	14,246	1,048	207,593
2001/2002	190,887	14,451	1,100	206,438

Source: Schools' Finance Branch, Manitoba Education, Training and Youth

PUBLIC SCHOOL EDUCATORS
1995/96 TO 2001/02

Year	Educators
1995/1996	13,921
1996/1997	13,888
1997/1998	13,315
1998/1999	13,358
1999/2000	13,493
2000/2001	13,492
2001/2002	13,568

Source: Manitoba Education, Training and Youth

PUPIL TEACHER RATIOS—PUBLIC SCHOOLS
(1995/96 to 2001/02)

	Regular Instruction	All Educators
1995/1996	18.9	15.3
1996/1997	18.9	15.4
1997/1998	18.7	15.3
1998/1999	18.8	15.3
1999/2000	19.0	15.2
2000/2001	19.0	15.4
2001/2002	18.5	15.0

Source: Schools' Finance Branch, Manitoba Education, Training and Youth

MANITOBA'S TEACHING FORCE (Public Schools) BY AGE
(1989/90 and 2001/02)

Age	1989/90		2001/02	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
20–24	507	3.5	398	2.9
25–29	1,688	11.6	1,394	10,3
30–34	2,060	14.1	1,496	11.0
35–39	2,728	18.7	1,762	13.0
40–44	3,202	21.9	2,025	14.9
45–49	2,286	15.7	2,425	17.9
50–54	1,408	9.6	2,956	21.8
55–59	538	3.7	926	6.8
60+	184	1.3	187	1.4
	14,601	100.0	13,569	100.0

Source: Manitoba Education, Training and Youth

FACULTY OF EDUCATION GRADUATES
(1984 to 2001)

	Total Number of Graduates	Employed on Regular Basis in Manitoba		Working as Substitutes in Manitoba	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent
1984	620	291	46.9	133	21.5
1985	648	358	55.2	93	14.4
1988	632	399	63.1	10	1.6
1989	720	407	56.5	93	12.9
1990	698	397	56,9	87	12.5
1991	784	336	42.9	46	5.9
1992	864	395	45.7	137	15.9
1993	873	436	49.9	106	12.1
1994	963	368	38.2	243	25.2
1995	872	255	29.2	190	21.8
1996	833	250	30.0	264	31.7
1997	836	331	39.6	234	28.0
1998	723	316	43.7	147	20.3
1999	723	354	49.0	104	14.4
2000	669	316	47.2	146	21.8
2001	753	351	46.6	132	17.5

Note: There is no data for 1986 and 1987.

Source: Manitoba Education, Training and Youth

Annual Teacher Retirements
(1990 to 2000)

Year	Retirements
1990	316
1991	314
1992	325
1993	399
1994	353
1995	408
1996	443
1997	524
1998	427
1999	516
2000	540

Source: TRAF

REFERENCES

[1] *Determining future supply and demand for Teachers.* Statistics Canada: Centre for Education Statistics, 2001.

[2] *Projection of Elementary and Secondary Enrolment and the Teaching Force in Canada, 1987–88 to 2006–07.* Ontario: Canadian Teachers' Federation, 1989.

[3] *Teacher Supply and Demand for the Public Schools of Manitoba, 1989–2000.* Manitoba Teacher Supply and Demand Task Force, 1991.

[4] *Nova Scotia Public Education Teacher Demand and Supply—Research paper.* Nova Scotia Department of Education, January 2000.

[5] *Teacher Supply and Demand in British Columbia—Enhancing the Quality of Education: Attracting, Recruiting and Retaining the Best Teachers.* British Columbia Teachers' Federation, December 2000.

[6] *Teacher Recruitment and Retention Initiatives.* Saskatchewan Education, Fall 2001.

[7] *It's All about Improvement: Report of the Task Force on Effective Schools.* Ontario, June 2001.

[8] *Teacher Recruitment and Retention—a Survey of Manitoba Public School Division/District Superintendent and Band School Principals.* Manitoba Education and Training, December 2000.

[9] *Recruiting Qualified Teachers—Teacher Supply and Demand.* Ontario: Canadian Teachers' Federation, 2000.

[10] *Teacher* Supply *and Demand: Forecasting the Weather is Easier.* Edward S. Hickcox, University of Manitoba, Educator's Notebook, vol 12, number 12, February 2001.

[11] *Teacher Education and Training—Pan-Canadian Research Symposium.* Ontario: description and papers can be found on the CMEC web-site www.cmec.ca.

[12] Levin, Benjamin and Young, Jon. *Understanding Canadian Schools.* Toronto: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1994.

[13] Darling-Hammond, Linda. *The Right to Learn: A Blueprint for Creating Schools that Work.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 1997.

[14] Sedlak, M. and Schlossman, S. *Who Will Teach? Historical Perspectives on the Changing Appeal of Teaching as a Profession.* Santa Monica, CA.: Rand, 1986.

[15] Centre on Personnel Studies in Education, 2002.